

# Long Term Plan 2024-2034

13<sup>th</sup> December

# Overview

---

1. Current rates position
2. Proposals for further discussion prior to inclusion in draft LTP
3. Next steps
4. Summary of proposals for inclusion in the draft LTP
  - Proposals for additional funding
  - Opex savings
  - Rates options

# Joint Development Process

---

- Based on detailed LTP Letter of Expectation from Council
- Focus on capital works deliverability and affordability
- Extensive Council briefings July-December 2023
- *What Matters Most* pre-engagement
- Increased focus on mana whenua, Community Boards, climate resilience
- Introduction of public briefings, recording and livestreaming

# Context

---

- Both nationally and locally, organisations and individuals are grappling with challenging economic conditions and the rising cost of living.
- Councils across the country are facing significant rates increases driven by inflation, interest and insurance costs.
- We are also grappling with the impacts of external influences outside our control. The Council is facing significant increases to non-controllable costs.
- Everything is important to someone – one person's 'must have' is another person's 'nice to have'. Our challenge now is to balance these competing values and priorities alongside the financial challenges that the Council is facing.
- The Council has indicated that they would like to aim to keep the rates increase for year one of the LTP between 9% and 12% (excluding Te Kaha). Today we will set out the opex options that could be used to achieve this.

# Current rates position

		24/25	25/26	26/27	27/28
Current position		13.38%	10.3%	5.2%	4.7%
CEO recommendations		-2.1%	0.6%	0.2%	0.6%
		11.3%	10.9%	5.4%	5.3%
Represented as:	Base	8.6%	9.7%	5.0%	5.4%
	Te Kaha	2.7%	1.2%	0.4%	-0.1%
If dividend is reduced		3.5%	-2.7%	-0.9%	-1.4%
Potential position	Base	12.1%	7.0%	4.1%	4.0%
	Te Kaha	2.7%	1.2%	0.4%	-0.1%

# Proposals for further discussion

Requests for funding and opex savings  
for discussion.

# Economic Development funding (ChristchurchNZ)

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Economic Development funding (ChristchurchNZ)	\$3.2m in Year 1 (on top of \$15.9m base funding)	2024/25 0.46%	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council does not provide any additional funding in year one but supports the <b>base funding</b> being adjusted for inflation in years two and three.</i>

# Events EcoSystem funding bid (ChristchurchNZ)

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Events EcoSystem funding bid (ChristchurchNZ)	\$2.9m in Year 1 \$3.34m Year 2 \$4.56m Year 3+	2024/25 0.42% 2025/26 0.03% 2026/27 0.12%	Defer to year 4 of the LTP	<i>The council defers Events EcoSystem funding until year 4 (2027/28) of the LTP.</i>



# Capital Endowment Fund

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Wind up the Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) <i>Linked to next proposal</i>	\$5,315,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council winds up the CEF, simplifying our funds and removing administrative costs. Savings net of transferring \$1.539m ChChNZ funding to rates.</i>
Apply uncommitted Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) proceeds to off-set the Strengthening Community Fund (SCF) for 3 years	\$2,350,000 pa. for 3 years	Alternate option	<i>If the Council chooses NOT to wind up the CEF, it applies uncommitted Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) proceeds to off-set the rates-funded Strengthening Community Fund (SCF) for 3 years.</i>

# Close or change specific contestable funding schemes

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Close or change specific contestable funding schemes and open the Strengthening Communities Fund to affected applicants.	Up to \$1,323,500:  Heritage Intangible Fund: \$161,500 p.a.  City Making Fund: \$342,000 p.a.  Sustainability Fund: \$380,000 (2024/25 only)  Bio Diversity Fund: \$340,000 p.a.  Accessibility Fund: \$100,000 p.a.	Include in the LTP	<i>The specified contestable funding schemes are closed and the Strengthening Communities Fund is opened to affected applicants.</i>



# Mayoral Forum climate resilience funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Mayoral Forum climate resilience funding	2024/25 \$39k 2025/26 \$152k 2026/27 \$111k	2024/25 0.01% 2025/26 0.01% 2026/27 -0.01%	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council includes this in the LTP following agreement at the Mayoral Forum.</i>

# Accelerating Coastal Hazards Adaptation Planning & Monitoring

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Coastal Hazards Opex (Accelerating Coastal Hazards Adaptation Planning & Monitoring)	\$TBC	TBC	Defer to year 4 of the LTP	<i>The Council defers additional opex funding for Coastal Hazards until year 4 of the LTP, putting a placeholder in the budget for year 4 of the LTP under the Community Adaptation Programme and continuing with the existing programme until 2027/28.</i>

# Merge Active Travel Targeted Rate with the UAGC

Proposal	Rates Impact	Potential Saving	Recommendation
Merge Active Travel Targeted Rate with the UAGC	No overall impact. Small effect on distribution of rates.		<i>Include in the LTP</i>

# Questions & Discussion

# Communicating the cost of Te Kaha to ratepayers

---

## Staff Proposal: No targeted rate but visible communications

- Included in communications around rates increase, highlight contribution of Te Kaha
- Based on planned capex and opex
- Optional: In material sent to ratepayers with assessment, provide link to website showing their individual rates contribution to Te Kaha

## Alternative: Targeted rate for transparency

- No change to any individual property's rates: a new rate with 4 differentials mimicking the value-based general rate
  - Pros: Contribution visible on annual assessment
  - Cons: Not a good communications tool. Rates system grows more unwieldy. Significant IT project. Difficult to administer and account for it.
- Only 1 “standard” differential for everyone: Would be simpler. But rates burden would move away from business towards residential

# Next Steps



# **(Current) LTP project milestones – looking ahead**

---

**20 December** – Councillor amendments due

**23 and 30 January** – Council briefings in reserve

**Late January** – staff advice on amendments

**8 February** – ARMC meeting to provide assurance on draft LTP

**Noon 9 February** – final deadline for LTP report public notification

**14 February** – Council meeting to adopt draft LTP and CD

**1 March- 5 April** – community consultation

**June** – adopt final LTP

# Appendix

Funding proposals and opex savings considered.

# Requests for Additional Funding

# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Changes to Venues Ōtautahi capital grant for asset renewals	\$1.6m in Year 1 (varies across LTP years)	0.01% on 2025/26 onwards rates (borrowing cost)	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council supports the request from VŌ for additional funding in the LTP to support the delivery of the VŌ asset management plan.</i>
Changes to Venues Ōtautahi operating grant	\$0.27m in Year 1 and 2, \$0.97m in year 3 onwards (+ inflated going forward)	2024/25 0.02% 2025/26 0.01% 2026/27 0.09%	TBC  Ask VO to review costs and provide more info	<i>In principle the Council supports the request from Venues Ōtautahi for small increase their annual operating grant, but request that VŌ look for additional savings within their current operating budgets to reduce the increases required from the Council.</i>
Changes to Venues Ōtautahi Te Kaha funding	2024/25 \$2.5m, 2025/26 \$0, 2026/27 - \$5.0m	2024/25 0.36%, 2025/26 -0.37%, 2026/27 -0.56%	TBC	<i>The Council is in discussions with VŌ on the potential to spread the FY25 cost across multiple years.</i>

# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Economic Development funding (ChristchurchNZ)	\$3.2m in Year 1 (on top of \$15.9m base funding)	2024/25 0.46%	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council does not provide any additional funding in year one but supports the <b>base funding</b> being adjusted for inflation in years two and three.</i>
Events EcoSystem funding bid (ChristchurchNZ)	\$2.9m in Year 1 \$3.34m Year 2 \$4.56m Year 3+	2024/25 0.42% 2025/26 0.03% 2026/27 0.12%	Defer to year 4 of the LTP	<i>The council defers Events EcoSystem funding until year 4 of the LTP.</i>
Arts Centre funding request	\$2.1m p.a.	2024/25 0.31%	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council decline the request to provide an annual grant of \$2.1 million to The Arts Centre to cover a forecast annual operating shortfall. Council ask staff to engage with the Trust and identify alternative options.</i>

# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Issac Theatre Royal funding request	\$2m in Year 1	2024/25 0.01%	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council forgives an interest free loan of \$2m granted to the Isaac Theatre Royal (ITR) to contribute to earthquake repairs in 2013, on the condition that the ITR Trust confirm that there is no expectation of any further Council funding outside of the contestable funding schemes.</i>
Orana Wildlife Park funding request	\$1.5m p.a.	2024/25 0.22%	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council decline the request to provide an annual grant of \$1.5 million to Orana Wildlife Park to cover an operating shortfall.</i>
Ferrymead Park operational funding request	\$1m p.a.	2024/25 0.15%	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council declines the request to provide an annual grant of \$1 million to Ferrymead Park.</i>

# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Riccarton Bush funding request	\$0.07m p.a.	2024/25 0.01%	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council includes an additional \$0.07m p.a. in the LTP for Riccarton Bush Trust, covering significantly higher insurance and an annual \$25k rather than \$200k lump sum provision for house painting.</i>
Mayoral Forum climate resilience funding	2024/25 \$39k 2025/26 \$152k 2026/27 \$111k	2024/25 0.01% 2025/26 0.01% 2026/27 -0.01%	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council includes this in the LTP following agreement at the Mayoral Forum.</i>

# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Coastal Hazards Opex (Hazards Screening)	\$0.25m in Year 1	2024/25 0.04%	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council approves annual funding of \$0.25m in FY 2024/25 for multi-hazard climate risk screening for the district and to understand the exposure and vulnerability of Council and other assets, accompanying engagement, and reporting cycles.</i>
Coastal Hazards Opex (Accelerating Coastal Hazards Adaptation Planning & Monitoring)	\$TBC	TBC	Defer to year 4 of the LTP	<i>The Council defers additional opex funding for Coastal Hazards until year 4 of the LTP, putting a placeholder in the budget for year 4 of the LTP under the Community Adaptation Programme and continuing with the existing programme until 2027/28.</i>
Visa level 2 annual QSA review/compliance	\$30k p.a.	Non-Controllable	Include in the LTP	<i>The council needs to include this in the LTP as it is a non-controllable and new cost.</i>



# Requests for Additional Funding

Proposal	\$	Rates Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Digital Software Costs	\$1.5m p.a. (not required in year 1, year 2 onwards)	TBC	Further information required	<i>Staff continue to look at this as part of a wider review of digital spend for inclusion in a future Annual Plan. Further information is required before a recommendation can be made.</i>
Flood Mitigation for Brenchley Avenue	\$17.5m (indicative only)	2024/25 0.06% 2025/26 0.13% (Indicative only)	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council does not proceed with flood mitigation for Brenchley Avenue.</i>
Flood management for Tenby Place and Newport Street	Progressed from within existing budgets	Nil		<i>The Council supports staff implementing a low-cost flood mitigation solution for Tenby Place and Newport Street that can be implemented within existing capital budgets.</i>

# **Savings from Efficiencies and Reductions**

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Wind up the Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) <i>Linked to next proposal</i>	\$5,315,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council winds up the CEF, simplifying our funds and removing administrative costs. Savings net of transferring \$1.539m ChChNZ funding to rates.</i>
Apply uncommitted Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) proceeds to off-set the Strengthening Community Fund (SCF) for 3 years	\$2,350,000 pa. for 3 years	Alternate option	<i>If the Council chooses NOT to wind up the CEF, it applies uncommitted Capital Endowment Fund (CEF) proceeds to off-set the rates-funded Strengthening Community Fund (SCF) for 3 years.</i>
Stop spending on the roving footpath crews	\$2,000,000 plus (\$1,000,000 in revenue)	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council continues to fund the roving footpath crews but reviews the success of the initiative after year 1 of the LTP.</i>

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Reduce current Zilch leased electric vehicle pool fleet by 50% and replace with equivalent purchased CCC owned electric pool vehicles	\$150,000 p.a.	Include in the LTP	<i>The current leased electric vehicle pool fleet is reduced by 50% (from 40 to 20 vehicles) and the vehicles are replaced with equivalent purchased CCC owned pool vehicles.</i>
Remove senior leader and councillor carparking	\$135,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Senior leader and councillor carparking is not removed.</i>
Reduction in consultants' fees and service contracts (Finance)	\$133,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Finance Unit's budget for consultant's fees and service contracts is reduced by \$133,000.</i>

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Reduce Enliven Places Maintenance from \$200,000 to \$100,000	\$100,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council reduces the Enliven Places maintenance budget by \$100,000.</i>
Reduce Enliven Places Consultants	\$28,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council reduces the Enliven Places consultants budget by \$28,000.</i>
Remove central city regeneration consultants' fees	\$89,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The City Growth and Property Unit's budget for central city regeneration consultants is removed.</i>

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Reduce the number of street trees planted	\$75,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The number of street trees planted is not reduced.</i>
Move interest rate on all new/renewed loans to Council's CoB plus 2% (7.4%)	\$60,000 (dependent on loans)	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council does not move the interest rate on all new/renewed loans to 7.4% (Council's cost of borrowing plus 2%).</i>

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Reduce the number of spaces leased in the Westend car park by 10	\$36,400	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council reduces the number of spaces leased in the Westend car park by 10 (already being implemented)</i>
Smart Christchurch commercialisation of projects (licencing to other councils)	\$26,147 + \$25,000 in revenue	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council explores opportunities to commercialise unique products developed by the Smart Christchurch Team.</i>
Disestablish Mayoral Project Fund	\$29,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Mayoral Project Fund is disestablished.</i>

# Savings from Efficiencies

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Cease the delivery of the Apprentice graduation and support for Mayor's Taskforce for Jobs	\$16,512	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council ceases the delivery of the Apprentice graduation and support for the Mayor's taskforce for jobs and continues to provide opportunities via other mechanisms.</i>
Civic Awards programme is reduced to every three years	\$9,091	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council continues to run the Civic Awards programme annually.</i>
Licence the operation or sell He Puna Taimoana	\$TBC	Do not include in the LTP.	<i>The Council continues to own and operate He Puna Taimoana.</i>



# Options for Increasing Revenue

# Options for increasing revenue

Proposal	Revenue Impact	Recommendation
Increase hourly resource consents processing fees.	\$200,000	<i>Include in the LTP.</i>
Increase hourly resource consents monitoring fees.	\$10,000	<i>Include in the LTP.</i>
Increase hourly fees for private plan changes.	\$5,000	<i>Include in the LTP.</i>
Explore the option of continuing to operate the Burwood landfill.	\$2,000,000	<i>Include in the LTP.</i>
Increase Charges for facilities events and venues including Akaroa wharf etc by 10%. (Reassess after 3 years.)	\$225,000	<i>Include in the LTP</i>
Install billboard at Parakiore before opening.	\$190,000 (FY 25 only)	<i>Include in the LTP</i>

# Options for increasing revenue

Proposal	Revenue Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Charge for car parking at the Botanic Gardens and Hagley Park (720 Carparks)	\$2.1m	Include in the LTP	<i>The Council includes this is the proposed LTP and begins charging for carparking at the Botanic Gardens and Hagley Park carparks.</i>
Increase on street parking charges from current rate of \$4.60/hour to \$6.00/hour and \$0.50c every year thereafter	\$600,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>On street parking charges remain at the current rate of \$4.60/hour.</i>
Increase off street parking charges from \$4.10/hour to \$5.00/hour	\$400,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Off street parking charges remain at the current rate of \$4.10 per hour.</i>

# Options for increasing revenue

Proposal	Revenue Impact	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Charge for specialist sports prep component of community sports field use 50% of Actual Cost \$10 per participant per seasonal activity	\$500,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>A charge for specialist sports prep is not included as a component of sports field use.</i>
Lease out 1-2 floors of Civic to external tenancies or explore options bringing CCOs back into Civic	\$TBC	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Leasing out 1-2 floors of Civic to external tenancies or relocating CCOs into Civic is not included in the 2024 – 25 budget but staff continue to explore opportunities to utilise the space available in Civic.</i>
Sponsorship of new mobile library vans and delivery trucks	\$TBC	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Sponsorship of the new mobile library vans and delivery trucks is unable to be included in this LTP as there is not enough information, but staff continue to explore options alongside other sponsorship/revenue opportunities within libraries.</i>

# Options with low level of service impacts

# Options with low level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Close or change specific contestable funding schemes and open the Strengthening Communities Fund to affected applicants	Up to \$1,323,500	Include in the LTP	<i>The specified contestable funding schemes are closed and the Strengthening Communities Fund is opened to affected applicants.</i>
Reduce contestable Strengthening Communities funding by 10%, 15% or 20% for three years	\$850,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Do not reduce Strengthening Communities Funding.</i>

# Options with low level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Retain holds charges (Intention was to remove charge if possible to improve access to information)	\$250,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Hold charges are removed.</i>
Potential reduction of public advice budget (Overall budget = \$1.2m. \$200k = 16%)	\$200,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Planning and Consents Unit's public advice budget is not reduced by \$200,000.</i>
Do not renew Gartner subscription	\$180,000	Include in the LTP	<i>The Gartner subscription is not renewed.</i>

# Options with low level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Continue to sweat Community Facilities assets for a further two years	\$100,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council does not pursue the option to continue to sweat community assets for a further two years.</i>
Reduce Heritage maintenance for Canterbury Provincial Chambers, Old Municipal Chambers and other Heritage buildings	\$100,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>Not recommended as we have a legal obligation.</i>
Place all sister city relationships into abeyance for 1 year	\$83,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council continues to maintain its sister city relationships.</i>



# Options with low level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Switch from CO2 to Sodium Bi-Sulphate to reduce the cost of pool chemicals	\$75,000	Include in the LTP	<i>CO2 is switched to Sodium Bi-Sulphate across our aquatics network.</i>
Reduce overall GCP budget as administered by CCC to \$1,070,000 from the current \$1,240,000 budget	\$63,750	Include in the LTP	<i>The CCC contribution to the Greater Christchurch Partnership budget is reduced by \$63,750, as agreed with the partners.</i>
Do not renew OfficeVibe subscription	\$16,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council retains and renews the OfficeVibe subscription.</i>

# Options with low level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Scrap Council Flag Network	\$10,753	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The Council flag network is retained.</i>
Review and refine the level of discretionary spend by Community Boards	\$TBC	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The current discretionary spending budgets for Community Boards are retained.</i>

# Options with high level of service impacts

# Options with high level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Include/ Do not include	Recommendation
Do not open the Network of outdoor summer pools (Te Hapua and Waltham) (Recreation, Sports and Events)	\$338,000	Do not include in the LTP	<i>The current summer pool season is retained (status quo).</i>
Reduce season length of outdoor summer pools (Te Hapua and Waltham) close at end of Feb instead of March. Explore opening in December not mid November (Recreation, Sports and Events)	\$60,000	Do not include in the LTP	

# Options with high level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Recommendation
<p>25% reduction in selected maintenance items amounting to a 10% saving on the total Maintenance budgets of \$40m with net annual savings of up to \$2m after NZTA subsidy.</p> <p>Savings areas include landscaping, amenity mowing, lichen removal, litter removal, sweeping, drainage inspections and clearing, surface repairs and markings across roads, footpaths and cycleways.</p>	<p>\$4,000,000</p>	<p><i>Do not include in LTP</i></p>



# Options with high level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Recommendation
Large community libraries - Sunday close half day.	\$213,000	<i>The following option would require more data (e.g. foot traffic, any potential revenue impact) before recommendation can be provided.</i>
Large community libraries - reduce weekday evening hours to 6 pm.	\$138,000	<i>The following option would require more data (e.g. foot traffic, any potential revenue impact) before recommendation can be provided.</i>
Tūranga - Sunday close half day.	\$175,000	<i>Do not include in LTP.</i>
Tūranga - reduce weekday evening hours to 6 pm.	\$123,000	<i>The following option would require more data (e.g. foot traffic, any potential revenue impact) before recommendation can be provided.</i>
Public holiday closure – Tūranga.	\$75,000	<i>Do not include in LTP.</i>
Open small libraries - 10 am weekdays	\$68,000	<i>The following option would require more data (e.g. foot traffic, any potential revenue impact) before recommendation can be provided.</i>

# Options with high level of service impacts

Proposal	Potential Savings	Recommendation
Increase frequency of citizenship ceremonies to one/week and hold ceremonies in the Te Hononga Civic Office Function Room.	\$47,004	<i>Do not include in LTP</i>
Regulatory Compliance & Licensing (Environmental Health). 80% of complaints in relation to excessive noise are responded to within one hour. [target is currently 90%].	\$40,000	<i>Do not include in LTP</i>
Street lights to be switched off for 3 hours overnight. 2am to 5am.	\$30,000	<i>Do not include in LTP</i>

# Conceptual Savings Options



# Conceptual savings options

Proposal	Potential Savings	Recommendation
Install Coppertree to analyse energy consumption. (Recreation, Sports and Events)	\$100,000	<i>Include in the 2024 - 2034 LTP.</i>
Review council wide service contracts	\$100,000	<i>Include in the 2024 - 2034 LTP.</i>
Stop accepting cash (Finance)	TBC	<i>Do not include in the 2024 - 2034 LTP.</i>

# Conceptual savings options

Proposal	Potential Savings	Recommendation
Sponsorship of "What's On" publication (Libraries)	TBC	<i>This option requires more data before recommendation can be provided</i>
Sponsorship for Tūranga's premium spaces (Libraries)	TBC	<i>Staff continue to explore renewing or finding new corporate partnerships for libraries premium named spaces.</i>
Shared services to neighbouring councils - content services, programmes and outreach (Libraries)	TBC	<i>This option requires more data before recommendation can be provided</i>